

4.0 ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL SIGNIFICANCE

4.1 HISTORIC VALUES

4.1.1 INTERPRETATION AND TOURIST USE OF AUSTRALIAN CAVES

(i) Comparable Australian cave resorts

The idea of providing pleasant planting and landscaping at cave-based tourist parks appears to be almost ubiquitous. The most representative examples in Australia include Naracoorte, Mount Gambier, Jenolan, Wombeyan, Yarrangobilly, Buchan, and Yanchep.

At Naracoorte the first manager, Daniel Battams (1885), was a cadet and William Reddan (1886), a professional horticulturist of considerable experience, then replaced him. With the help of his daughter Agnes, Reddan planted trees, garden beds, and rock gardens. Some visitors said the gardens were even more beautiful than the caves! Reddan also had the support of his photographer friend, William Augustus Francis, son of the former director of the Adelaide Botanic Gardens. After Reddan's retirement, Robert Leitch (1920) continued the tradition, planting trees selected from other parts of Australia and also establishing trellises with wisteria and other creepers. Regrettably, all this creativity fell away in the post-war years and today one has to search to find any evidence of the beauty that once was.

At Mount Gambier, the three major depressions that mark the site of caves within the township are all developed today as delightful gardens. The so-called Town Cave was the site of the first settlement (1841), and gradually evolved as a central square with formal planting and garden furniture. W.D. Robinson developed its current character in 1925. James Umpherston bought the site that now bears his name in 1866, and developed it as a recreational and cultural venue. It fell into disuse and decay, but was restored by the social club of the Woods and Forests Department. Englebrecht established a distillery at the third site and poured his waste and other rubbish into the cave. Starting in 1989, volunteers cleaned and rehabilitated the site, planted a native garden, and now operate the site as a tourist attraction. So, Mount Gambier now has three cave gardens, each in excellent condition.

Jenolan next deserves attention. The caves were discovered in the late 1830s and gradually developed as a tourist venue but with little attention given to the grounds. Then in 1895, the hotel was destroyed by fire, the site was then taken over by the Government, and a new much grander hotel designed by architect J.L. Vernon. This was based upon British styles, and remains to this day as an imposing and picturesque half-timbered mock-Tudor building. In 1897, Joseph Maiden, director of the Sydney Botanic Gardens, was asked to review the previous plantings and re-establish a designed garden. Regrettably, some of the plants that he selected, particularly sycamore, later proved to be very troublesome weeds. There has been considerable change and modernisation, without integrated planning for overall continuity of design, and the impact upon both the architecture and gardens is regrettable.

Wombeyan and Yarrangobilly share selected tree plantings and this has effectively enhanced the landscape. In particular, Yarrangobilly has tree-lined walks of Lombardy poplars and some elms, which is reminiscent of the traditional homestead plantings of the Alps.

Yanchep, an extremely popular picnic venue on the Northern edge of Perth, has a range of buildings, tree plantings, various rock garden forms and a lake. Although tourist use commenced in the early years of the twentieth century, it was in 1931–32 that tourist

infrastructure was greatly developed, and like Buchan included a spring-fed swimming pool.¹ Like Jenolan, there has been no overall theme or integrity in either the original development or subsequent 'modernisation'. So it is a pleasant and interesting site, but not one of great aesthetic quality. However, after a considerable period of relative neglect, a major program of restoration and re-development is now under way.

Buchan, like Wombeyan and Yarrangobilly, is largely dependent upon tree planting. However, the evolution of the planting and landscape has been continuing on a basic well-integrated theme. Some early tree planting was instituted by Frederick Wilson about the cave entrances and central park area from 1907–21, but the major landscaping commenced in the late 1920s when landscape designer Hugh Linaker [see 4.3.3] developed a comprehensive plan (1929)—the first such master plan for the site—that greatly extended these earlier plantings. Over the ensuing decade Linaker supervised all of the planting, but he died just before the official opening of the National Park (1938). Some of the planting was also undertaken by manager Frank Moon, and then brought to its final form by Albert Sandford who came to Buchan after serving as a foreman gardener at the Melbourne Botanic Gardens.

So, Buchan is distinguished by its continuity and the professionalism of the designers and gardeners that ensured its striking beauty. It is no surprise that Buchan won the National Award for the best Campsite and Caravan Park in Australia on a number of occasions.

(ii) Caves infrastructure

The infrastructural development of the Buchan Caves has been subject to a multitude of influences, but generally these were essentially utilitarian and based on an unsophisticated application of the technology of the time. Moreover, most installations have since been replaced or modified and do not meet any test of continuity or integrity.

However, an outstanding exception is the work of Frederick Wilson, engaged by the government in 1907, initially to develop and manage the newly discovered Fairy Cave. He remained as manager until his retirement in 1921. During this period he discovered and/or explored a number of other caves. Thus, he was also responsible for the development of Royal Cave and Federal Cave.

Wilson came from long experience at Jenolan Caves and a brief period of work at Margaret River in Western Australia. He was largely responsible for the design and construction of the wire netting barriers to safeguard the cave decorations against vandalism. He carried out this work with an excellent and steadily improving quality of tradesmanship. In particular, he had a remarkable sensitivity to environmental and aesthetic values that drove his work. At both Jenolan and Buchan, this has resulted in most of the caves remaining in excellent condition as compared with other caves opened to the public over the same period.

The best example of his skill at Buchan (and probably the best in any cave) is that in the Royal Cave from the point of entry into the very richly decorated section through to the flowstone known as *Niagara* [see 3.2.3]. The protective netting is particularly neat in design and well constructed. Further, he 'improved' the aesthetic quality of the site by taking stalagmites removed during the pathway construction and placing these in what now appear to be perfectly natural positions in the *Font of the Gods* pool. The *Twelve Apostles* display only had three stalagmites when first discovered and as depicted by Howard Bulmer in the first photograph of the site. Another aspect of his work that deserves attention is the wrought iron

¹ L.E. Shapcott, *The Story of Yanchep: The Western Wonderland*, Government Printer, Perth, 1933.

posts that support much of the handrails. These were handmade by a blacksmith and have shown remarkably longevity.

(iii) Provision of camping and caravan facilities

Camping, and especially its luxurious vehicular manifestation, caravanning, was a by-product of the increased mobility that motor vehicles provided from the early twentieth century. Just as guest houses had initially catered for those who relied on the provision of transport by a third party, such as state-run or commercial train, bus, and steam-boat services, so camping provided for those with access to the mobility of motor touring. The former camping ground on the banks of the Buchan River is an example of the unpretentious nature of this early phase of tourism: for example, the 1938 RACV Camping and Caravanning Guide apologetically stated that the site 'was 'not available when the Buchan River is in flood'.²

In the United States the National Park Service felt a strong mandate to bring the public to the national parks and the organisation believed that the federal and state governments had an obligation to encourage travel to the parks by railroad and automobile. At about the time of the First World War, the Service put a great deal of effort into developing co-operative relationships with the railroads and the automobile clubs, highway associations, and other organisations which were emerging across the nation as the car increased in popularity and Americans became more mobile. By 1917, free automobile camps opened in each national park, established in specially cleared areas complete with the requisite facilities. All parks were to be open to cars and vehicles of all kinds, and provide a variety of facilities for the comfort of tourists. After the war there were an increasing number of motorists that the parks had to accommodate. Concessionaires, who offered a campsite and a nearby dining hall, as, for instance, at Yellowstone National Park, ran early campsites at this time.³

Peter Spearritt and Jim Davidson, in *Holiday Business: Tourism in Australia since 1870*, draw attention to the rise in camping and caravanning as an option for Australian holidaymakers. 'The state motoring clubs, which grew out of the earlier cycling clubs, soon realised that many of their members were campers or potential campers. The RACV produced its first camping guide in 1934 and distributed it free to members. Because of the extraordinary demand for copies, a second edition was produced the following year ... The RACV guides concentrated on Victoria, along with explicit advice about campsites on the Hume and Princes Highways for travellers to Sydney on interim destinations. The 1934 guide listed seventeen camping areas on or adjacent to the Princes Highway in Victoria and sixteen in NSW. By the time of the second edition just a year later, another three sites had been added in Victoria—Buchan, Mallacoota and Mackenzie River, while forty-three had been added to the NSW component. Most of the NSW additions were sites already in existence, and some of the lesser known ones may have been brought to the RACV's attention by knowledgeable members.'⁴

A.D. Mackenzie—Chief Engineer of the Public Works Department and a key promoter of development at Buchan Caves—was a keen caravanner and in the RACV's magazine *Radiator* in 1936 he sketched a rosy picture of the caravan's potential: 'What a different feeling! Carefree, no schedule to adhere to, no timetables to watch, and an absence of the orthodox routine of the holiday guest house ... When the motorist becomes familiar with all

² *The Official R.A.C.V. Camping and Caravanning Guide*, Broadbent's Official Road Guides Co., Melbourne, c.1938, p.75.

³ Linda Flint McClelland, *Building the National Parks: Historic Landscape Design and Construction*, Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore and London, 1998, pp.124, 131, 134, 144.

⁴ Jim Davidson & Peter Spearritt, *Holiday Business: Tourism in Australia Since 1870*, Melbourne University Press (Miegunyah Press), Carlton South, Vic., 2000, p.172.

that the caravan has to offer in the form of an ideal, restful, cheap and health-giving holiday, I can visualise our magnificent highways teeming with this class of transport.' Mackenzie told readers about life in a 15-foot caravan, on an 800-mile journey around Victoria. He pointed out that on such a trip, unlike a shipboard journey, there was no need to replenish one's wife's wardrobe. His Crusader caravan contained all the comfort and convenience of 'a modern suburban flat'. In quoting Mackenzie's article, Spearritt and Davidson comment 'As in much other promotional literature of the time, the virtues of caravan were almost an end in themselves, the experience of life on the road so liberating that destination could seem secondary.'⁵

The camping facilities at Buchan Caves were consistently praised in early guides. Representative of these was *Keith Winser's Caravans and Touring Manual*, published annually from the late 1940s with Australia-wide coverage. The camping ground at Buchan Caves was often pictured and praised. In 1955, for instance, Winser stated: 'The charm of Buchan is not limited to being one of Australia's finest camping grounds, for it is one of the most picturesque districts in the country. There are many fine excursions to caves—rated by many as the finest in Australia. The Buchan River meanders through the park and there are fine swimming baths with the most modern conveniences at this State-run resort which entices the caravanner.'⁶ Winser again drew attention to Buchan Caves in 1956 with a photograph, and enthused 'Buchan Caves Caravan Park is unique! Cradled in the mountains, with many easy grades from Lakes Entrance, it has a pool, stream, caves and is one of the most beautiful parks in all the world. Don't miss it if you like bellbirds and English style countryside.'⁷ Even in the early 1960s, Winser's publication were still praising Buchan Caves as an 'Ideal spot, especially for campers. The Camping Park consists of every modern convenience, including a playground, lounge, hot and cold showers and a car wash. The caves themselves are internationally famous for their beauty and antiquity. Inspection of the caves, accompanied by experienced guides, occupies approximately five hours. Principal caves are the Royal, Federal and Fairy.'⁸ Facilities such as car parks and picnic facilities were also provided for day visitors, who in the case of Buchan Caves Reserve, might for instance have stayed at Lake Entrance.

Comparable though less extensive facilities were developed at Bright, a popular destination in Victoria's north-east and starting point for a visit to Mount Buffalo (its steep winding road unsuited to caravans). The 1954 edition of Winser's *Manual* drew attention to the 'Community Kitchen of stone ... an amenity at the leading camping grounds in Victoria'. The example at Bright, similar to that at Buchan Caves, was pictured and the joint role of state (through the Public Works Department) and local government was highlighted.⁹ In his annual summary of facilities, Winser commented: 'Tourists from all over Australia are clear in their praise for the continual progress made by the Victorian Public Works Dept., in building new sewered comfort stations and camping park improvements. These attractive buildings put Victoria in the forefront of ideal holidaying territory. The beauty of them is that they are all over the countryside.'¹⁰ At this time most camping grounds were located on foreshore reserves, along river banks, at the local oval or reserve (including botanic and public gardens). Some local government employed a part-time ranger, or delegated this duty to a staff member

⁵ Davidson & Spearritt, op.cit., p.176, quoting *Radiator*, 15 July 1936, p.10.

⁶ *Keith Winser's Caravans and Touring Manual No. 7 for 1955*, Australian Motor Manual, Melbourne, 1955, p.43.

⁷ *Keith Winser's Caravans and Touring Year Book No. 8 for 1956*, Australian Motor Manual, Melbourne, 1956, p.47.

⁸ Keith Winser, *Highways of Australia Road Atlas: Motor Manual's Tourist Guide*, Australian Motor Manual, Melbourne, 7th ed., c.1961, p.54.

⁹ *Keith Winser's Caravans and Touring Year Book No. 6 for 1954*, Australian Motor Manual, Melbourne, 1954, p.35.

¹⁰ Keith Winser, 'Ports of Call: Caravan Touring', *ibid*, pp.5–6.

such as the gardens curator, or in the case of commercial parks, a live-in owner or manager attended to the needs of tourists. At the time of its development (1938) and for many years later, the camping ground at Buchan Caves Reserve was unique in Victoria as an example of a state-run camping ground. Chalets for accommodation for tourists had been built by the state at remote destinations such as Mount Hotham (1884), Mount Buffalo (1910), Darby River (1920s), and the huts along the Upper Yarra–Walhalla track (1912), and some tourist facilities were provided through the Public Works Department, but apart from Buchan Caves Reserve the state did not enter into this field of camping until the advent of the camping ground at Tidal River in the Wilsons Promontory National Park in the early 1950s.¹¹

This theme well demonstrated by the Former camping ground (Section 3.4.1), Main camping ground (3.4.2), Tennis court (3.5.5), Swimming pool (3.5.7), Barbecue (3.5.10), Car wash site (3.5.14), Kitchen (3.5.18), Laundry site (3.5.19), ‘Communal Hall’ / Kiosk (3.5.22), Playground (3.5.24), Rotunda (3.5.30), and Rustic signs (3.5.37).

(iv) Links to Gippsland generally

Buchan Caves Reserve, by virtue of its status as one of Gippsland’s leading tourist attractions, had many links to the region. The most important of these were transport routes, initially via rivers, lakes and roads, which formed linear networks. Buchan Caves were often cited in support of the need for extension of the railway network to East Gippsland, and by the time that Fairy Cave was opened, the new railway provided an alternative route to Buchan. Some of these networks still exist (notably the roads, and to a lesser extent railways) and form part of the contemporary visitor experience, while others (notably lake and river navigation) are now defunct. Whether in use or not, these linear transport networks retain considerable associated infrastructure (e.g. wharfs, railway stations, and bridges). It is beyond the brief of the current Heritage Action Plan to identify these in detail, but their value to the interpretation of Buchan Caves Reserve is considerable.

4.1.2 PRE-WAR AUSTRALIAN NATIONAL PARKS

In the nineteenth century, as a reaction to the shortcomings of the Industrial Age, efforts at wilderness preservation emerging from the ‘back to nature’ movement became widespread. In various countries, groups arose that were influential in achieving legislation for environmental protection. The Society for the Preservation of Nature formed in 1854 in France; The Commons, Open Spaces and Footpaths Preservation Society was established in the United Kingdom in 1865; and the Sierra Club was established in 1892 in the United States.¹² The term ‘national park’ originated in the U.S.A. in 1870, when Judge Cornelius Hedges of Montana suggested that a spectacular area of the Rocky Mountains should be ‘set apart as a great national park ... never to be changed, but to be kept sacred always.’ This area was reserved as Yellowstone National Park, the first such park in the world, in 1872.¹³

Prior to this time, efforts had been made in New South Wales and Victoria to set aside areas of scenic beauty. The first national park in Australia was dedicated in 1879, when the

¹¹ The huts and the Mount Hotham hospice were destroyed in the 1939 fires and the Darby River Chalet by commandos at the end of World War II, although Mount Buffalo Chalet remains in use for its original purpose, albeit managed commercially. See Jane Lennon, *Our Inheritance: Historic Places on Public Land in Victoria*, Department of Conservation and Environment, East Melbourne, 1992, p.70.

¹² Esther Anderson, *Victoria’s National Parks: A Centenary History*, State Library of Victoria, Melbourne, 2000, p.1

¹³ *ibid.*, p.2.

colonial government of New South Wales declared a rugged sandstone plateau near Port Hacking to be 'The National Park' (later Royal National Park).¹⁴ In Victoria in 1866, an area of 597 hectares near Warrnambool had been set aside as a public park to preserve its outstanding geological features. This area, encompassing Tower Hill, was given the status of a national park, Victoria's first, in 1892, by a special act of parliament.

The development of national parks in Victoria has parallels with their development in New Zealand, Canada, and the United States. As occurred in the latter, the first national parks in Victoria were reserved due to pressure from enthusiastic groups and individuals rather than from government perception of the need to preserve natural features. In these early days, recreational needs took precedence over conservation. The confused mix of conservation and recreation values in national parks persist world-wide to the present time and is formally recognised in the IUCN classification of protected areas.

Royal National Park in New South Wales was reserved to provide 'a national domain for rest and recreation' and seen more as a sanctuary from city pollution and crowded conditions for Sydney residents than as a sanctuary for native flora and fauna. Within a decade, the Park contained roads, stables, blacksmith, orchard and deer park, and the trustees had the power to set aside areas as zoological gardens, racecourses, cricket grounds and for military exercises.¹⁵

By 1892 there were calls to reserve parks on an Australia-wide basis, and Ferdinand Mueller was particularly influential in creating a climate conducive to preservation throughout Australia.¹⁶ Following the creation of Tower Hill National Park in 1892, from 1898 a number of areas in Victoria were set aside under the Lands Act as 'sites for national parks'. In each case a local committee of management usually managed the area under the Lands Act. The first of these, in July 1898, was a temporary reserve of 36,842 ha at Wilsons Promontory. This was closely followed in October 1898 by a temporary reserve of 1166 ha at Mount Buffalo.

After Federation, the new constitution left environmental matters as largely a state responsibility with the Commonwealth government having the power to override state government decisions on land use in some cases. However, direct responsibility for administering Crown lands still resided with each state, and thus the reservation of lands for parks continued to be controlled by the states. Following Federation there were a few tentative initiatives towards developing a national approach to managing natural resources, however this did not eventuate until the early 1970s.

In 1908, the Lord Mayor of Melbourne convened a meeting to support the existing national parks, and urge the reservation of more in order to protect native flora and fauna and encourage tourism. As a result of this meeting, the 'Vigilance Committee' was appointed as watchdog over the existing national parks. This later became known as the National Parks Association, and was absorbed into the Town Planning and National Parks Association in 1914. In 1945 this organisation was renamed the Town and Country Planning Association.¹⁷

With an expanding population and diminishing areas of undeveloped land, various groups and individuals pressed for the reservation of 'unspoilt' areas for recreation and to protect native plants and animals. This led to the declaration of a number of parks or reserves in the early 1900s. These were generally areas of little value for other purposes and were managed under the Lands Act by locally appointed committees of management, composed largely of unpaid

¹⁴ *ibid.*, p.3.

¹⁵ *ibid.*, p.4.

¹⁶ *ibid.*, p.55.

¹⁷ *ibid.*, pp.72, 74.

volunteers. No money was allocated by the Lands Department for the upkeep of the parks, and committees of management struggled to make ends meet by leasing grazing land and selling timber — and so damaging the natural features they were trying to protect.’¹⁸ In 1909, similar reserves were made at Wyperfeld (3887 ha), Mallacoota Inlet (4615 ha) and Wingan Inlet (1927 ha). By 1930, Kinglake, The Lakes, Ferntree Gully, Churchill, Tarra Valley, Bulga, Lind and Alfred ‘National Parks’ had also been reserved. Some of these had previously been other types of reserves under the Land Act.

During the late 1940s, various groups including the Field Naturalists’ Club of Victoria, Town and Country Planning Association, Youth Hostels’ Association, Royal Automobile Club of Victoria, and the Federation of Victorian Walking Clubs joined forces to campaign for an improved national park system for Victoria. In 1952, the Victorian National Parks Association was re-established as an independent organisation, and in the same year, a parliamentary committee formulated recommendations for improvements of Victoria’s national parks, but no legislation was passed until the inaugural National Parks Act in 1956. Although Tower Hill was omitted, thirteen National Parks were included and a National Parks Authority with a membership of 11 was set up to administer the Act. In 1957, Crosbie Morrison was appointed Director of National Parks, with a staff of 12, although he died soon afterwards. Dr Len Smith succeeded him, serving for next eighteen years. Between 1956 and 1975, eleven new national parks were created.

In 1970, the State Development Act abolished the National Parks Authority and created a new Department with a Director of National Parks. This department became known as the National Parks Service (after the United States usage) but in 1972, the Ministry for Conservation Act was passed, and the National Park Service was brought into new Ministry for Conservation as one of the many land conservation initiatives of the Hamer government. New far-reaching legislation contained in the National Parks Act of 1975 retained the concept of national parks, but extended it to include management of other types of reserve. The National Parks Act of 1978 further increased the number of national parks.¹⁹

Buchan Caves Reserve became a national park in 1939 on the recommendation of Sir Albert Eli Lind, Minister for Forests and Lands. Lind was especially concerned with developing tourism, and was keen to provide roads and suitable infrastructure within the national parks.²⁰ As in the United States, accessibility to the national parks, and accommodation on arrival, were important issues. As a result, a major building programme was undertaken to upgrade the facilities in the reserve. Buchan Caves, from its inception as a national park, benefited from a high level of expertise brought to its committee of management by its members. Each committee member had a portfolio specific to his skills, and the committee’s Melbourne base ensured an objective and professional approach.

Very few committees could afford the services of paid rangers. Wilsons Promontory, Mount Buffalo, Tarra Valley, Bulga and Kinglake, however, were the exceptions, having resident workmen or caretakers whose salaries were paid from the meagre returns from visitors’ and other fees. Similarly, Buchan Caves reserve had benefit of the services of a caretaker in some form from 1902, when Frank Moon was employed as a Crown lands bailiff, and in 1907 Frank Wilson was employed as a curator.

This theme is well demonstrated at Buchan by the Entry Arch (3.5.1), Former camping ground (3.4.1), Main camping ground (3.4.2), Tennis court (3.5.5), Swimming pool (3.5.7), Barbecue (3.5.10), Car wash site (3.5.14), Kitchen (3.5.18), Laundry site (3.5.19),

¹⁸ *ibid.*, p.70.

¹⁹ *Parks and Wildlife*, 2 (3–4), April 1979, pp.117–22.

²⁰ Anderson, *op.cit.*, p.69: Lind National Park, in east Gippsland, was reserved in 1925 and named after the Minister for Lands A.E. Lind (p.76).

‘Communal Hall’ / Kiosk (3.5.22), Playground (3.5.24), Rotunda (3.5.30), Rustic signs (3.5.37), and Fairy Cave entrance (3.5.35).

4.1.3 GOVERNMENT SOCIAL POLICY

During the early decades of the Buchan Caves Reserve located adjacent to the township, from its first reservation in 1901, in which 160 acres were temporarily reserved from sale ‘for Public Purposes and for the protection of the natural features’, until its subsequent consolidation with the other caves reserves of the district into one comprising 863 acres in nine discrete parcels (including the main Buchan Caves Reserve of 724 acres) in 1938, the Victorian government was closely involved in supporting the reserve’s protection and development, especially as an expression of various social policies. This support was provided through the close involvement of government instrumentalities such as the Victorian Railways (Tourist Bureau and Betterment and Publicity Board, both under the management of the railways) the Country Roads Board, and the Public Works Department in the development and promotion of such reserves [see 4.2.2]. Increasingly during the 1920s and 1930s, reserves such as that at Buchan Caves were seen to provide an affordable, health-giving family holiday, and reflected the rising international popularity of active sports at this time.

Keeping pace with this social evolution, Buchan Caves reserve saw its greatest period of development during the latter of these two decades, initiated by the committee of management’s decision to allow camping inside the reserve in 1929.

The committee of management for the reserve was ‘composed of Government executives, having regard to expert knowledge’ and the Victorian Public Works Department was integrally involved with development of the reserve.²¹ This Department provided cost estimates for erection of toilets, septic tanks, tennis courts, swimming pool, bridges, road repair, and provided designs for the caretaker’s cottage, new structure at the entrance to the reserve, and structures at the entrance to Federal Caves and exit to Royal Cave [see also 4.3.iv]. The Public Works Department also organised construction of many of the works for which it provided estimates or designs, such as the installation of the electric lighting in the caves in 1919, building of bridges, road repair, and the entrance to Federal Cave. This involvement, however, had its most obvious expression in the major construction works undertaken as part of the opening of the reserve as a national park in 1938 [see 4.3.iv].

The Betterment and Publicity Board of the Victorian Railways actively promoted the reserve as a destination, and in 1935, the Victorian Railways issued a combined rail/road ticket to Buchan in recognition of the reserve’s increasing popularity, despite the deprivations of the Depression.²² The Forests Commission was the source of many of the trees for Buchan Caves reserve, planted to beautify the area and provide shade and shelter for campers and picnickers.²³ In late 1937, the Country Roads Board took over maintenance of the main roadway through the reserve at the Committee’s request, and the Public Works Department received a grant of £150 for construction of the entrance to the reserve.²⁴

Almost a decade after camping was first developed, the Chief Engineer of the Public Works Department reported that ‘There are undoubted possibilities in the further development of this area by the provision of other attractions for visitors to the caves, also as a camping area with modern facilities. As part of the scheme for improvement of tourist resorts of the State,

²¹ *Argus Week-end Magazine*, 3 December 1938.

²² Committee of Management minutes, 13 December 1935.

²³ *ibid.*, *passim*.

²⁴ *ibid.*, 27 October 1937.

this area commends itself.’²⁵ In a further effort to improve this already very successful state tourist resort, the Buchan Caves committee of management drew up a proposal for development for the reserve. In an attempt to fulfil one government social policy, tourism, the committee attempted to utilise another government social policy—‘work for the dole’. The ‘work for the dole’ scheme was a government response to an alarming growth in unemployment. By 1929, unemployment in Australia rose to 13.1%, the ‘highest percentage of unemployment yet recorded’, up from 8% in 1925.²⁶

In Victoria, as in other states, the government had made some efforts to address this crisis as early as 1928, when it established unemployment relief camps in country Victoria. These were an initial step in a scheme of creating a range of major public works aimed at generating employment during the Great Depression. Otherwise unemployed men were paid a sustenance wage to labour in various capital works projects such as the construction or rebuilding of roads and bridges. The Country Roads Board carried out such projects.²⁷ Throughout 1930, however, unemployment continued to escalate, quarter by quarter, from 13.1% to an unprecedented 20.5%.²⁸ In response to this development, the states were forced to establish unemployment funds, which were financed mainly by emergency income taxes. These funds were then distributed to the unemployed in two forms: sustenance and special relief work.²⁹

Sustenance, mainly in the form of ration orders that could be exchanged for food staples was the principal means of assisting the unemployed. As the cost of this assistance escalated and financial stringency eased, the states resorted to various forms of relief works. South Australia, Tasmania, and Victoria went as far as making labouring on relief works a condition of receiving sustenance in what became known as ‘work for the dole’.³⁰ The Buchan Caves committee of management made various attempts to secure some of the unemployment fund money for development of the reserve. As early as July 1930, it requested that the Minister of Public Works allocate £300 out of Unemployment Relief to provide labour for the commencement of tree planting in the reserve. Although the committee was unsuccessful on this occasion, the reserve derived direct and substantial benefit from the sustenance branch of the state Department of Labour during the latter part of the 1930s.³¹

Sustenance projects soon included not only country but also metropolitan projects. The Department of Labour created a sustenance branch and the ‘Work in Return for Sustenance’ Scheme was established by 1933.³² Works were expanded to include various railway regrading schemes, harbour and jetty works, road construction, floodways, and sewerage works. The development of Albert Park Lake, permanent construction of part of Sydney Road, and construction and integration of the Yarra Boulevard and the Great Ocean Road were examples of work carried out in Victoria with funding from the sustenance scheme. In the Buchan area, the construction of the Ensay–Buchan and the Orbost–Buchan roads resulted

²⁵ Memo from A.D.Mackenzie ‘Development Buchan Caves Reserve’ submitted for the information of the Employment Council in Buchan Caves Advisory Committee ‘Development’ BC 21 file.

²⁶ Commonwealth Bureau of Statistics, [source?](#), 1930, p.400.

²⁷ CRB Correspondence File, [VPRS ???](#), Unit 45 File 28/ 9782.

²⁸ Commonwealth Bureau of Statistics, [source?](#), 1930.

²⁹ Stuart Macintyre, *The Oxford History of Australia, Volume 4: 1901–1942*, Oxford University Press, Melbourne, 1986, chapter 12. The Unemployment Relief Works Board was established under the *Unemployment Relief Amendment Act* 1930. Prior to this, relief works were authorised on the recommendation of the departments concerned and of a sub-committee of Ministers.

³⁰ Macintyre, op.cit., [p.???](#)

³¹ Committee of Management minutes, 4 July 1930, 19 September 1930.

³² CRB Correspondence File, [VPRS???](#), File 33/ 9409.

from sustenance projects, and an 'unemployed camp' was situated at nearby Gelantipy in 1936.³³ The scheme continued throughout the 1930s, with its conclusion only made possible with the advent of World War Two, and the resultant full employment in the armed forces.

Throughout the 1930s the committee of management continued to seek funds for necessary works in the reserve, such as stabilising the road surface by the reduction of creek erosion. 'Many sections of the roadway are endangered by the erosion of the creek and assistance from the Rivers and Streams Fund will be sought to carry out protective works.'³⁴ In 1937, the Betterment and Publicity Board strongly recommended that the committee of management approach the Minister for Lands (who was Chairman of the Unemployment Relief Fund Committee), to obtain the necessary funds for initial works in the reserve's proposed development into a national park.³⁵

In 1938, the committee received unemployment relief funds, with an initial amount of £1500 allocated to the reserve by the Employment Council. These funds, for the further improvement and development of the reserve, were to be used for the most urgent works including work on the roadway and a new entrance to Fairy Cave. A further amount of £4500 was sought by the committee to enable the carrying out of the early part of the project consisting of construction of a new roadway from the entrance of the Power House (engine house) to beyond the Fairy Cave entrance, improvements to Royal Cave flooring and drainage, regrading of walking tracks, construction of a swimming pool and clearing the camping area and adding amenities including the tennis courts, fencing fauna park. This work was estimated to give employment to 37 men for a period of 6 months and indirect employment to 6 men for a similar period (in sawmills and quarries).³⁶ Although details provided by the relevant minutes of the Committee of Management are sketchy, it is apparent that the funds from the Employment Council were forthcoming and construction and other works rapidly progressed under the supervision of the Public Works Department.

This theme is well demonstrated at Buchan by the Entry Arch (3.5.1), Main camping ground (3.4.2), Tennis court (3.5.5), Swimming pool (3.5.7), Barbecue (3.5.10), Car wash site (3.5.14), Kitchen (3.5.18), Laundry site (3.5.19), 'Communal Hall' / Kiosk (3.5.22), Playground (3.5.24), Fairy Cave entrance (3.5.35), and Main roadway (3.6.1).

4.2 SOCIAL / SPIRITUAL VALUES

4.2.1 CONTINUITY OF USE

From the early twentieth century until the present, the major use of Buchan Caves Reserve has been as a means of protecting natural features and as a site for viewing and interpreting these features to the public. Other uses have taken place on this land, but the continuity of this protective and interpretative use has been the major feature of the reserve, and is the aspect that gives the site its distinctive qualities. This use has been dictated by the natural values, but has over time acquired a rich overlay of cultural values. The social values of this use are best demonstrated through the interaction of people with the reserve, and thus through the

³³ Committee of Management minutes, 8 September 1933, 14 February 1936.

³⁴ Memo from A.D. Mackenzie 11.4.1938 'Development Buchan Caves Reserve' submitted for the information of the Employment Council, in Buchan Caves Advisory Committee 'Development', BC 21 file.

³⁵ Memo from Betterment and Publicity Board, to **Secretary for Lands ?** in 15 September 1937.

³⁶ Memo to the Secretary, Employment Council on the Development of Buchan Caves reserve from A.D. Mackenzie, 11 April 1938 in BC 21 file.

camping grounds, the caves and their infrastructure, and the various buildings and structures erected in conjunction with visitors such as the shelters and barbecues.

4.2.2 LINKS TO BUCHAN TOWNSHIP AND IMMEDIATE LOCALITY

Buchan Caves Reserve has an obvious physical link to the township of Buchan and, by virtue of its generous size and the related cave and karst sites in the vicinity, with the locality more generally. The physical relationship with the township governed the boundaries of the early site reservations, yet the nature of the local topography meant that the reserve was largely separate visually, a quality reinforced by the very narrow entrance along the Buchan River valley.

In 1929, the Committee of Management examined several sites on the Buchan River to assess their suitability for camping. At this time, the committee, which was based in Melbourne and only visited Buchan for occasional inspections, commented on the neglected state of the main street of Buchan. The committee noted with dismay the ‘rubbish tip’ in front of the garage, broken tree guards scattered about, and the native trees planted were all dead. ‘Altogether this street is a very poor advertisement for what is now practically a government township’ and resolved to write a letter to the Tambo Shire Council drawing its attention to this state of affairs.³⁷

Historically the Reserve was a major drawcard for visitors and tourists, many of whom travelled to Buchan specifically to see the caves. This had an obvious effect on the local economy, particularly in the earlier part of the twentieth century when travel was slower and more reliance was placed on accommodation within the township. The importance of the Reserve as a source of employment or income—either directly or indirectly—for those in the township and in the immediate locality is a continuing feature. Development of the Reserve also had tangible benefits for Buchan: in the early 1930s, for example, some electric lighting was provided in the township (following moves by the Buchan Progress Association), powered by the generator in the Caves Reserve.³⁸

Socially, the Caves have been a large part of the history of Buchan, and this continues today, especially through oral history traditions. Activity at the Buchan Caves Reserve inevitably became enmeshed with local politics and family rivalries: how could it be otherwise in such a small and remote community, with a government-sponsored facility and employer on its doorstep. Frederick Wilson, reporting illegal entry and damage to the Lilly Pilly Cave in 1916 suggested that ‘something be done to sift these matters’. He added: ‘If a good detective be sent up I may be able to give him a line to work on. I do not mean to say I know the party but a stranger may get at the facts.’³⁹

4.3 AESTHETIC VALUES

4.3.1 LINEAR QUALITIES OF DESIGNED LANDSCAPE

The design of Buchan Caves reserve has been largely dictated by use of creek valleys as means of access for roadways, at least since 1909 when the present roadway was formed (obviating the use of the track over the hill from the police paddock). The linear nature of the

³⁷ Committee of Management minutes, 9 April 1929.

³⁸ Committee of Management minutes, 4 July 1919, 16 October 1931, 24 June 1932, 26 August 1932.

³⁹ Department of Sustainability and Environment, reserve file, Rs 1288, 19 May 1916.

design combined with the linear nature of the caves themselves and more indirectly on the linear nature of transport routes leading to the Caves from centres of population. The whole experience of travel to Buchan Caves is a linear one, and this has been heightened within the reserve (especially from 1938) by the succession of built features, such as the entrance archway, arrival at Caves House, the tantalising facilities of the tennis courts and especially the swimming pool, the criss-crossing of Spring Creek, arrival at the camping ground with its visitor facilities, and then the continuation of the road to Fairy Cave with the culminating experience of the steps and entrance structure. In this linear design, the bridges were used as 'markers' along the valley spine and this are especially demonstrated by their sequential numeric nomenclature. The landscaping has enhanced the linear experience by the contrasting use of (predominantly) European trees along the valley floor, amongst the indigenous eucalypts. This is able to be appreciated from the roads and tracks, but also from elevated positions. The linear landscape is, especially enhanced by seasonal colour that in autumn spills like a lava flow down the creek valleys. The strong contrast between the inner and outer reserves has been a consistent feature of the landscaping.

Modern buildings such as the Guides room have adhered to this linear design pattern by virtue of necessity but the presence of a strong single roadway with flanking facilities contributes greatly to the sense of arrival at the Reserve, and also contributes to the low-key nature of the reserve, and especially the camping ground.

4.3.2 RUSTIC DESIGN ETHOS

(i) Introduction

Whilst a comparative analysis of architectural, landscaping, and engineering works at Buchan necessarily touches on historic values, given the strong rustic design ethos, it seems appropriate to place this analysis under the heading of aesthetic values. The design of the 1938 works, particularly the entrance archway, kitchen, laundry and shower/toilet block (both now demolished), lounge/kiosk, Fairy Cave Entrance, and signs all characterise this design idiom. The influence appears to stem from several sources, including a general awareness of North American designs, and also contemporary United States National Parks Service and Public Works Department of Victoria designs.

Prior to the creation of the United States' National Parks Service in 1916, the seventeen national parks and twenty-two national monuments in existence throughout the country had been administered by the Department of the Interior with the support of the army. In 1917, the newly formed National Park Service took control, with dual objectives of preserving the integrity of the national parks, while making them accessible. To fulfil these potentially conflicting aims, landscape architects employed in the National Park Service forged a cohesive style of naturalistic park design, where landscape was preserved and all built features harmonised with nature. This ethic of design, commonly referred to as rustic, guided park development and management for many years, and led to many National Park Service designs being adopted in parks throughout the world.

(ii) National Parks Service influence—buildings and structures

The development of national parks in the United States drew from the mainstream principles and practices of the American landscape design profession. In the United States in the 1880s, Frederick Law Olmsted (designer of New York's Central Park) and architect Henry Hobson Richardson worked together to create a sturdy, rustic style of design for North American park buildings and structures. This distinctive style featured rugged proportions, the use of native stone and timber, rustic stonework, bold arches and naturalistic siting. With variations, this

style became widely adopted in the design of shelters, bridges, and other structures for American parks, both urban and state, in the late nineteenth century, and in the twentieth century it was embraced by the Arts and Crafts Movement.⁴⁰

As mentioned before, national parks were administered by the Department of the Interior and the army prior to 1916. Through the American Civic Association and the American Society of Landscape Architects, the landscape profession avidly supported the establishment of the National Park Service (remaining under the aegis of the Secretary for the Interior) and influenced its organisation, and when the National Park Service was formed, landscape architects were employed for their expertise in planning park development.⁴¹

The National Park Service was established to preserve the integrity of the parks, while making them accessible. The foremost issue was how to develop the parks to attract and accommodate people of all economic circumstances. It was recognised that buildings and structures, while necessary in the parks, should be subordinate to the natural landscape, and fit harmoniously into the surroundings.⁴² To achieve this, common principles used in country or rustic areas of city parks were immediately adopted —construction was to disturb the ground as little as possible, obtrusive development was to be avoided altogether or placed in inconspicuous locations and screened from public view, and buildings and structures were to be of native materials and rustic in character.⁴³

As early as 1917, it was recognised that the best approach for designing harmonious park structures was to use native materials available on site. This was practical and cost-effective, as the construction cost of buildings of any type had a \$US1500 ceiling.⁴⁴ In the early 1920s, a National Park Service landscape architect Daniel P. Hull, explored the use of native materials such as rocks, logs and timber, and studied pioneer forms such as traditional log cabins and pueblo structures. Hull developed these ideas into a distinctive, non-intrusive rustic park building design that became known as ‘parkitecture’.⁴⁵

The range of buildings and structures erected in national parks from 1917 included community buildings such as laundries, stores, post offices, bathing facilities, kitchens and shelters. A spacious community hall or dining room, with tables, chairs and fireplaces, where campers could socialise and shelter from inclement weather was an important addition to national park facilities. Such buildings continued to be popular features of park campgrounds in the 1920s and 1930s.⁴⁶ By the late 1920s, the three-sided ‘village plaza’, featuring boulder-lined paths and curbs, and log lamp posts, characterised a number of national parks.⁴⁷ [Lee: Check page and exact wording]

Gateways held particular importance and were among the first structures built to mark the entrances to the parks. These were simple in design, dignified and in harmony with their surroundings. The gateways introduced an architectural theme that harmonised with the natural setting of each location. This architectural theme could then be repeated in the other structures in the park, thereby creating a consistent identity throughout the park.⁴⁸ The gateways served also as points of transition, orientating park visitors to an environment where

⁴⁰ McClelland, op.cit., pp.3, 4.

⁴¹ ibid., pp.3, 8.

⁴² ibid., p.135 ?

⁴³ ibid., p.135.

⁴⁴ ibid., p.149.

⁴⁵ William H. Tishler (ed.), *American Landscape Architecture: Designers and Places*, The Preservation Press, Washington, D.C., 1989, p.172.

⁴⁶ McClelland, op.cit., p.152.

⁴⁷ ibid, p.168.

⁴⁸ ibid., pp.124–26.

nature predominated, and amenities were rendered inconspicuous through harmonious structures.⁴⁹

Bridges too were an important feature of national parks, and around 1915, these were usually made of rough-hewn timber cut on site. Arch construction was favoured. Concrete was used in Yellowstone National Park, but many thought that only natural materials should be used. Bridges were built to suit the particular needs of the location.⁵⁰

Principles of landscape preservation and harmonisation were followed in the external design of park structures, so that structures took on a unique character in harmony with the specific site, rather than being constructed to a standardised design. By 1928, many of these principles began to be marked on plans and drawings for bridges, guardrails and buildings. This difference distinguished the design of National Park Service structures, leading to originality of ideas and diversity of expression.⁵¹

However, in the 1930s, the design principles, processes and practices of the National Park Service became institutionalised nationwide. During this decade, the National Park Service supervised the development of state parks across the United States. To facilitate this, it became necessary to publish the principles and practices. Such publications included the National Parks Service's *Portfolio of Comfort Stations and Privies* (1934), *Portfolio of Park Structures* (1934), Albert Good's *Park Structures and Facilities* (1935) and three-volume *Park and Recreation Structures* (1938). All provided models and principles for designing park structures.⁵²

North American architecture was well known in Australia by the 1930s, and the influence of the Californian bungalow on Australian housing had been quite profound since the 1920s. The style had a slightly more rusticated manifestation in the Craftsman bungalow, derived from American east-coast farmhouses and mountain hunting lodges, and often incorporated handcrafted detailing. Such designs were eagerly promoted in local architectural and home-building journals, and through books such as Henry Saylor's book *Bungalows: Their Design, Construction and Furnishing, with suggestions also for camps, summer homes and cottages of similar character* (Philadelphia, 1911), widely available in Australia.⁵³ Much 1930s architecture in Australian national parks showed the influence of this North American architecture. Examples in Victoria include the clubhouse at Yarra Bend National Park, structures at the Grampians, and, in the Melbourne Metropolitan area, buildings at Wattle Park.

This theme is well demonstrated at Buchan by the entrance archway (3.5.1), kitchen (3.5.18), lounge/kiosk (3.5.22), Fairy Cave entrance (3.5.35), rustic signs (3.5.37), boulder and log curbing and fencing (3.5.38), swimming pool (3.5.7) and barbecue (3.5.10). It was also formerly seen in the laundry (3.5.19) and shower/toilet block (3.5.21), both now demolished. The rotunda (3.5.30) at Buchan appears to be slightly earlier than the 1938 works, but also draws on a rustic design ethos.

⁴⁹ *ibid.*, p.126.

⁵⁰ *ibid.*, p.129.

⁵¹ *ibid.*, p.5.

⁵² *ibid.*, p.7: *Park Structures and Facilities* (1935) was held by the Public Library of New South Wales and an early but undated photographic copy was held in the library of the Sydney Botanic gardens, indicating the contemporary availability of such works in Australia.

⁵³ Graeme Butler, *The Californian Bungalow in Australia*, Lothian Books, Port Melbourne, 1992, chapters one and two; see also John Clare, 'The post-Federation house in Melbourne: Bungalow and Vernacular Revival styles', research report, Faculty of Architecture and Planning, University of Melbourne, 1984.]

(iii) National Parks Service influence—landscape

In order to blend construction with the natural setting of the national parks, principles of naturalistic or informal landscape design, rooted in the nineteenth-century English gardening tradition, were adopted by the National Park Service. These principles included preservation of existing natural features and vegetation, selection and framing of vistas, screening of obtrusive elements, planting of native species, use of local native materials, and traditional or pioneer methods of construction.⁵⁴ This resulted in the revival of planting practices promoted in the nineteenth century by English, and later, American landscape designers. Several of these techniques, including the planting of climbing vines to disguise concrete and stone walls, and the use of ferns around foundations, had been favoured by the Arts and Crafts Movement, and accompanied the use of native wood and rock as construction materials to harmonise a structure with its natural setting. Naturalistic devices such as rock gardens, fern gardens, vine-draped walls, curvilinear paths and stairs and boulder-lined walks had been popular in the Adirondacks⁵⁵ and had regional equivalents in California gardening.⁵⁶ By carefully following these principles, park designers were able to create or maintain the illusion that nature had experienced little disturbance and that a stone water fountain or flagstone terrace was as much at home in a park as a stand of hemlocks or meadows of wildflowers. Natural springs were transformed into pipe-fed pools, and bush rock gardens were created to provide places of appealing beauty.⁵⁷ In the years following the formation of the National Park Service, its landscape architects forged a cohesive style of naturalistic park design, which had a lasting influence on the character of national, state and metropolitan parks and public highways across the United States.⁵⁸

At Buchan Caves, such naturalistic devices employed by Linaker in his planting plan of 1929 specified the creation of rockeries (at Royal Cave entrance), deciduous vines draped over structures (the ‘pergola’), and the careful screening of conveniences with shrubbery (swimming pool changing rooms). Linaker retained the indigenous trees along the valley floor and augmented them using a mixture of native trees and exotics. This planting of native eucalypts in conjunction with exotic (largely deciduous) trees provided a strong contrast between relatively dull evergreen foliage and stunning autumn colour, a device valued by both English and North American landscape designers. The beauty of North American autumnal foliage was known throughout the world, and trees such as Scarlet Oak (*Quercus coccinea*), Pin Oak (*Quercus palustris*) Maple (*Acer* spp.) Sweet Gum (*Liquidambar styraciflua*) and American Ash (*Fraxinus americana*) were highly favoured for their seasonal colour, and were included in Linaker’s planting suggestions for the reserve. The use of ‘spiry-topped’ trees such as conifers on hillsides and rocky banks was popular amongst the designers of the National Park Service in America,⁵⁹ and this design device also featured in Linaker’s plan for the reserve. He planned the planting of cypresses and pines on the steep valley sides, as well as groves of eucalypts and many species of acacia. In the National Park Service, shrubs such as rhododendrons and azaleas were popular choices for screening purposes, and these plants were recommended by Owens for inclusion in the reserve in 1940.

⁵⁴ McClelland, op.cit., pp.2–3.

⁵⁵ The Adirondacks is a region in the north east of New York state, incorporating the spectacular scenery of the Adirondack Mountains, and a popular tourist and holiday destination for East Coast Americans.

⁵⁶ McClelland, op.cit., p.264.

⁵⁷ *ibid.*, p.263 [see also p.264 check](#)

⁵⁸ *ibid.*, p.136.

⁵⁹ *ibid.*, pp.30–34.

(iv) Public Works Department influence

The Victorian Public Works Department (PWD) was integrally involved with development of the Buchan Caves reserve, and some of this influence has already been canvassed under a consideration of government social policies (see section 4.1.3). The influence of the Public Works Department was of considerable aesthetic value to Buchan Caves Reserve for the manner in which the Department translated contemporary ideas about national parks into a coherent design idiom for the Reserve during its transformation into a national park in 1938.

The twentieth-century history of the Public Works Department is yet to be written.⁶⁰ Sufficient is known, however, to place the buildings and structures at Buchan Caves Reserve within the context of the PWD's output. The first aspect worthy of notice is that the designs come from the office of the Chief Engineer rather than the Chief Architect. During 1934–53 the design output of the PWD was strongly influenced by Chief Architect Percy Everett. A talented designer, Everett had travelled in Europe and was eclectic in his design approach. Despite his seniority, Everett exercised considerable control of designs, and adopted a progressive approach, embracing modernist ideas. The careers of the PWD's chief engineers of this period, by contrast, are poorly documented. The drawing of the 'Buchan Caves Communal Hall', for instance was prepared by 'R.E.B.: Engineer' and checked by A.C.D.: Chief Engineer'; detailed design correspondence relating to the design of the swimming pool was prepared by PWD engineer A.C. Drew; and site inspections with the Minister for Lands were made by Chief Engineer A.D. Mackenzie. The absence of any documented involvement by Everett or his architects may not necessarily indicate a lack of influence. It seems likely that projects—especially one of such topical relevance as the Buchan Caves Reserve—would be discussed generally within the department, and that the PWD engineers had access to the same library material as the architects. This point may be crucial in the design influence, and comparable designs were being published in many overseas books and journals. Drew, for instance, made reference in correspondence to the *American Swimming Pool Data and Reference Annual*, and this points to a wide availability of comparable design literature within the Departmental library and elsewhere.

The involvement of the PWD at Buchan is consistent with its work in building other tourist facilities, such as the Yarra Bend Golf Course clubhouse (1936), 'comfort stations' at Halls Gap and Lorne (1939), work at several beaches and foreshore reserves, and even at Royal Melbourne Zoological Gardens.⁶¹ This theme is well demonstrated by the Entry Arch (3.5.1), Swimming pool (3.5.7), Barbecue (3.5.10), Car wash site (3.5.14), Kitchen (3.5.18), Laundry site (3.5.19), 'Communal Hall' / Kiosk (3.5.22), and Fairy Cave entrance.

4.3.3 EUROPEAN INFLUENCE ON PLANTING

The predominant use of exotic trees in landscaping the valley floor of the Buchan Caves Reserve was a continuation of nineteenth-century horticultural trends. The trees were deliberately chosen for their contrast with the surrounding forest trees, and especially for the aesthetic contrast between deciduous exotics and evergreen indigenous trees (particularly by the selection of species with colourful autumn foliage). The contrast also extended to the use of evergreen exotic trees, especially conifers, which formed such a contrast to the local forest trees. In many ways the tree selection represented a lingering influence of mid-nineteenth

⁶⁰ A national research project examining Australian public architecture 1900–50 is currently under way at the University of Melbourne, under the direction of Phillip Goad and Julie Willis, with researcher Terry Sawyer.

⁶¹ Terry Sawyer, pers comm., 9 July 2003; surprisingly there are no photographs depicting buildings and structures at Buchan Caves Reserve within the PWD photographic collection.

century interests in acclimatisation of exotic plants, and was little different to the planting palate used in many nineteenth-century Victorian botanic gardens and public parks. The European influence was felt mostly in the choice of species—including the many Australian species recommended by Linaker—for the colour of their flowers, or the shape of their canopies, rather than any naturalistic qualities which might complement the existing forest cover. The trees were also viewed as the predominant feature of the landscaping scheme, with the selection of species chosen for individual qualities, rather than the creation of any graded canopy of plants from small shrubs to large trees. In promoting these attitudes, the role of the Victorian Tree Planters' Association was significant.

The Victorian Tree Planters' Association was formed during Melbourne's annual Garden Week festival in April 1926, when John Thomas Smith, Curator of Parks and Gardens at the Melbourne City Council, called a meeting of nursery proprietors and park curators to discuss common problems, including the need for increased tree planting and the provision of public parks in urban areas. The need for an association to take on an advisory role on these matters became apparent, and the Association was formed. Two of those most involved with the landscaping of Buchan, Caves Reserve, Hugh Linaker and Jack Owens, were deeply involved with the Association.⁶²

Hugh Linaker (1872–1938), landscape gardener, horticulturist, and tree planter, was born at Ballarat (Vic.) and gained his training and earliest work in that district. In 1901 he was appointed Curator of Parks and Gardens for the municipality of Ararat. Linaker set about landscaping the area later known as Alexandra Park, officially opened in 1907, when his work in transforming the previous wilderness of mullock heaps and a mining dam set against the unpropitious backdrop of Ararat Gaol was widely praised. His chance for promotion came when the Victorian government advertised for an 'Ornamental Gardener' for the newly established Mont Park Hospital for the Insane. Linaker was appointed 'landscape gardener, Hospital for the Insane, on probation for twelve months' in 1912 and had his position as landscape gardener for the Lunacy Department confirmed in 1913. Linaker's new position (of which he was the first incumbent) required him 'to give his expert advice at any of the other Hospitals for the Insane should he be required to do so'. Linaker set about his task with zeal and soon established a thriving plant nursery close to his departmental residence in Upper Plenty Road; during 1916, for instance, 10,700 plants were forwarded from Mont Park. Linaker initiated new landscaping or enhanced existing work at each of the hospitals under his control. He was a frequent lecturer and an inaugural member of the Victorian Tree Planters' Association (1926). He was keenly interested in tree-planting projects on main highways. Many municipalities sought his advice for the planning of public parks and gardens. Apart from Buchan, Linaker advised on tree planting at the State Electricity Commission's model township at Yallourn (1925–31), Mount Buffalo National Park (1920s), Yarra Bend National Park (1930), as well the landscaping of numerous public buildings, especially police stations and prisons. Around 1933 Hugh Linaker was appointed State Superintendent of Parks and Gardens, and invited to undertake the landscaping of the King's Domain (1933). A year later he designed the Pioneer Women's Memorial Garden in the Domain. When he died shortly before the opening of the Buchan Caves National Park, Linaker was also the senior Victorian public servant with responsibility for horticulture and landscape design, and was regarded by many as the leading landscape gardener of his generation in Victoria. Linaker's hallmark was his bold design ethos—he favoured 'planting

⁶² The Victorian Tree Planters' Association ultimately became the Royal Australian Institute of Parks and Recreation, and more recently Parks and Leisure Australia: see Elizabeth Stewart, *Places in the Park: A Sixty Year History of the Royal Australian Institute of Parks and Recreation 1926–1986* (Dickson, ACT, 1991).

for the future’—and his contribution to Australia’s garden history is his pioneering landscape architectural work in a period before that profession was given due regard.⁶³

John Stanley (Jack) Owens (1899–1989), parks administrator, commenced a long career with Melbourne City Council in 1922 as senior clerk for the Council’s Parks and Gardens Committee (working under J.T. Smith, who recommended him for the work at Buchan in 1940). He became Director of Parks and Gardens (later Superintendent of the Parks, Gardens and Recreations Department) in 1947, a position he held until retirement in 1964. As a park administrator he supported innovative ideas such as the increasing use of sophisticated park maintenance equipment after World War Two, and the introduction of recreation movement ideas to Australia in the late 1940s and 1950s. Owens was secretary (1926–47), then president (1947–65) of the Victorian Tree Planters’ Association, whose annual conference became a pivotal event for members, enabling them to exchange ideas and information, and form networks of those concerned with parks and recreation throughout Australia.⁶⁴

4.4 SCIENTIFIC VALUES

4.4.1 COLLECTION OF TREES OF HORTICULTURAL IMPORTANCE

Buchan Caves Reserve is part of a network of government reserves that contain or form designed landscapes. These were predominantly created in the nineteenth century, but Buchan is a fine example of one created in twentieth century. These reserves ranged from botanic gardens and public gardens at the most ornamental, to cemeteries and recreation reserves at the more modestly ornamented end of the scale. These reserves were in many cases favoured by plants from the Melbourne Botanic Gardens, or from other government nurseries. These reserves contain outstanding collections of trees, individually and especially as a network. The collection at Buchan is of outstanding horticultural and botanical importance on account of the large number of specimens, range of species, exceptional growing conditions, known age of many specimens, coherent planting policy, and some outstanding individual specimens, such as *Populus deltoides* var. *virginiana*, *Casuarina cunninghamii*, *Pinus halepensis*, *Pinus nigra* var. *corsicana*, *Eucalyptus melliodora*, *Chamaecyparis funebris*, and *Pinus canariensis*. Buchan Caves Reserve is comparable in its horticultural richness to the most well-endowed of Victoria’s provincial botanic gardens.

4.4.2 PROTECTION OF OUTSTANDING NATURAL FEATURES

Although this aspect is discussed under historic significance [see 4.1.1 (ii)], the scientific significance is worthy of a brief separate discussion. It is not the role of the current Heritage Action Plan to assess natural values, but the report by Boadle (1991 [see 5.2.1] makes clear that such values are of a very high order. Items such as the infrastructure in the caves, the fencing around the doline, and even the protective nature of the cave entrances all possess some modest scientific value for the manner in which they protect and permit interpretation of features of outstanding natural value.

⁶³ ‘Linaker’ in Richard Aitken & Michael Looker (eds), *The Oxford Companion to Australian Gardens*, Oxford University Press, South Melbourne, 2002, p.371.

⁶⁴ ‘Owens’ in Aitken & Looker, op.cit., pp.457–58.

4.5 STATEMENT OF CULTURAL SIGNIFICANCE

The Buchan Caves Reserve, part of the outstanding Buchan–Murrindal cave system, set aside in 1901 for public purposes and the protection of natural features, and developed as a national park from 1938, is of statewide cultural significance for the following values.

Historic values

Buchan Caves Reserve is of outstanding historic value as an Australian cave reserve, distinguished by the continuity and professionalism of the designers and gardeners that ensured its striking beauty, and by the extent and intactness of its buildings and works.

The infrastructure of the caves within the Buchan Caves Reserve includes intact examples of the pioneering work of Frederick Wilson which demonstrate an excellent and steadily improving quality of tradesmanship, and a remarkable sensitivity to environmental and aesthetic values; at Buchan (and at Jenolan) this has resulted in most of the caves remaining in excellent condition as compared with other caves opened to the public over the same period and the quality of this early work is now rare on a national and even international basis.

At the time of its development (1938) and for many years later, the camping ground at Buchan Caves Reserve was unique in Victoria as an example of a state-run camping ground and caravan park, and it remains of outstanding historic value on a national basis as an example of an inter-war camping ground and caravan park.

Buchan Caves Reserve, by virtue of its status as one of Gippsland's leading tourist attractions, is of historic value to the region for its links to a network of transport routes via sea, rivers, roads, and railways, whose collective value to the interpretation of Buchan Caves Reserve is considerable.

Buchan Caves Reserve is of considerable historic value as an example of an early tourist attraction in Victoria based on natural themes, and one that played an important part in the evolving definition of what constituted a national park.

Buchan Caves Reserve retains many attributes (especially as buildings and works) possessing high historic value for the manner in which they can demonstrate government social policy of the early years of the twentieth century; these include land management, the broad interpretation of departmental responsibilities (such as the railways and public works) to promote social agendas, and response to the Great Depression through unemployment relief schemes.

Social / spiritual values

The continuity of use of Buchan Caves Reserve for the protection and interpretation of natural features is of high social value to the present generation and this is best demonstrated through the interaction of people with the reserve, and thus through the camping grounds, the caves and their infrastructure, and the various buildings and structures erected in conjunction with visitor use.

Buchan Caves Reserve has social value for the people of Buchan township for its close physical links, its economic effect on the local economy, and for its dominance in the history of Buchan.

Aesthetic values

The linear design of Buchan Caves Reserve is of considerable aesthetic value and has been largely dictated by the nature of the creek valleys combined with the linear nature of the caves themselves; this dominant design theme is found in the strongly defined single roadway with flanking facilities, the narrow band of exotic planting, and the succession of built features leading to the linear nature experience of the caves.

The rustic design ethos adopted at the Buchan Caves Reserve, especially during its transformation into a national park in 1938, is of high aesthetic value, particularly as an early Australian example of naturalistic landscaping strongly influenced by contemporary United States National Parks landscape ideals.

The influence of the Victorian Public Works Department is of considerable aesthetic value to Buchan Caves Reserve for the manner in which the Department translated contemporary ideas about national parks into a coherent design idiom for the Reserve during its transformation into a national park in 1938.

The European influence on planting of Buchan Caves Reserve is of outstanding aesthetic value for the maturity of the early landscaping and especially its design which utilised predominantly deciduous exotic trees with individual aesthetic attributes (such as flower or leaf colours, distinctive canopy shapes), provided a spectacular seasonal effect in autumn, and provided an aesthetic contrast with the surrounding native forest trees; this scheme was largely influenced by the outstanding landscaping of Hugh Linaker, a pioneering designer of public landscapes in Australia, and its careful maintenance and refinement by those who followed, including Jack Owens, one of Victoria's leading managers of public parks and gardens.

Scientific values

The collection of trees at Buchan Caves Reserve is of outstanding horticultural and botanical importance (and therefore of scientific value) on account of the large number of specimens, range of species, exceptional growing conditions, known age of many specimens, coherent planting policy, and some outstanding individual specimens; the Reserve is comparable in its horticultural richness to the most well-endowed of Victoria's provincial botanic gardens.

The early infrastructure in the caves, the protective nature of the cave entrances, and the fencing around the doline are of modest scientific value for the manner in which they protect and permit interpretation of features of outstanding natural value.

Buchan Caves Reserve is part of an area of outstanding natural significance, although this aspect has not been assessed as part of the current Heritage Action Plan. Likewise, the assessment of Aboriginal cultural values has not been part of the current brief.